



# Radiation doses to patients from barium meal and barium enema studies in the Western Cape Province, South Africa



Dr TC Kotzé, Caroline Nabasenja, Mrs F Davidson, Prof. P Engel-Hills, Groote Schuur Hospital and University of Cape Town, Cape Town

## Introduction

Barium studies are radiographic procedures used to diagnose abnormalities of the digestive system. The ionising radiation used in these procedures is potentially harmful and therefore needs to be monitored.

Study Aim:

1. Investigate radiation dose received from the barium meal (BaM) and barium enema (BaE) examinations
2. Recommend regional Diagnostic Reference Dose Levels (DRDLs) for these procedures



Figure 1: Barium meal examination demonstrating the stomach (Source: www.ispub.com)



Figure 2: Barium enema examination demonstrating the colon (Source: www.imaginggroupde.com)



Figure 3: Example of a fluoroscopic unit



Figure 4: DAP meter mounted onto light beam diaphragm of x-ray tube

## Methodology

- Study sites : 3 state hospitals
- Fluoroscopy units: digital and conventional units
- n = 25 BaM and 30 BaE patients
- Measuring Instrument: Dose Area Product meter (DAP)

| Key of abbreviations |                                  |
|----------------------|----------------------------------|
| BaM                  | - Barium meal                    |
| BaE                  | - Barium enema                   |
| DAP                  | - Dose Area Product meter        |
| DRDLs                | - Diagnostic Reference Levels    |
| D                    | - Digital fluoroscopy units      |
| C                    | - Conventional fluoroscopy units |

## Objectives

## Findings

### BaM

### BaE

| Objectives                                                               | BaM                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | BaE                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|--------------------------|----------------|--|----|----------------------------|----------|--|-----------------------|----------|--|---------------------------------|-----------|------|-----------------------|-----------|--|-----------------------|--|----|-----------------------------------|--|----|---------------------------------|------|----|-------------------------------|----|--|------------------------------------|--------|--|---------------------------------|--------|--|---------------------------------|-------|--|--------------------------|--|-------|-----------------------------|------|--|-----------------------------|----|----|----------------------------------|----|--|------------|------|------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------|------|--------------------------|----------------|--|----|----------------------------|------|--|-----------------------|-----------|----|--|-----------|--|-----------------------|--|------|-----------------------|--|----|-----------------------|--|----|---------------------------------|--------|--|--|--------|--|------------------------|--|----|-----------------------------------|--|----|---------------------------------|----------|--|-------------------------------|--------|--|---------------------------------|-------|--|--------------------------|-------|--|----------------------------|----|----|----------------------------------|-----|--|------------------------------------|--------|--|-------------------------------------|----------|--|------------|------|------|
| 1. Measure radiation dose for BaM and BaE                                | Mean Dose: 16.6 Gy <sub>cm</sub> <sup>2</sup><br>Median Dose: 13.6 Gy <sub>cm</sub> <sup>2</sup><br>First and third quartile DAP values: 10.4 Gy <sub>cm</sub> <sup>2</sup> and 20.1 Gy <sub>cm</sub> <sup>2</sup>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | Mean Dose: 28.7 Gy <sub>cm</sub> <sup>2</sup><br>Median Dose: 27.4 Gy <sub>cm</sub> <sup>2</sup><br>First and third quartile DAP values: 18.8 Gy <sub>cm</sub> <sup>2</sup> and 36.5 Gy <sub>cm</sub> <sup>2</sup>                                                                                                         |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| 2. Compare the radiation doses with those previous international studies | <p>Table 1: Mean and third quartile DAP values for BaM</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Author</th> <th>mean</th> <th>3<sup>rd</sup> quartile</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>DWP, 1992 (UK)</td> <td></td> <td>25</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Broadhead et al. 1995 (UK)</td> <td>7.75 (D)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hart et al. 1996 (UK)</td> <td>24.18(C)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Warren-Forward et al. 1998 (UK)</td> <td>11.39 (D)</td> <td>17.1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hart et al. 2002 (UK)</td> <td>21.26 (C)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hart et al. 2007 (UK)</td> <td></td> <td>13</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Carroll &amp; Brennan, 2003 (Ireland)</td> <td></td> <td>13</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Yakoumakis et al. 1999 (Greece)</td> <td>23.3</td> <td>17</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Delichas et al. 2004 (Greece)</td> <td>25</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Geleijns et al. 1998 (Netherlands)</td> <td>15 (D)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Ruiz-Cruces et al. 2000 (Spain)</td> <td>28 (C)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Ruiz-Cruces et al. 2000 (Spain)</td> <td>39.85</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vano et al. 1992 (Spain)</td> <td></td> <td>39.90</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Curaj et al. 2005a (Serbia)</td> <td>23.3</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Curaj et al. 2005b (Serbia)</td> <td>15</td> <td>18</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vardus et al. 2005 (Switzerland)</td> <td>67</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>This study</td> <td>16.6</td> <td>20.1</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | Author                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | mean | 3 <sup>rd</sup> quartile | DWP, 1992 (UK) |  | 25 | Broadhead et al. 1995 (UK) | 7.75 (D) |  | Hart et al. 1996 (UK) | 24.18(C) |  | Warren-Forward et al. 1998 (UK) | 11.39 (D) | 17.1 | Hart et al. 2002 (UK) | 21.26 (C) |  | Hart et al. 2007 (UK) |  | 13 | Carroll & Brennan, 2003 (Ireland) |  | 13 | Yakoumakis et al. 1999 (Greece) | 23.3 | 17 | Delichas et al. 2004 (Greece) | 25 |  | Geleijns et al. 1998 (Netherlands) | 15 (D) |  | Ruiz-Cruces et al. 2000 (Spain) | 28 (C) |  | Ruiz-Cruces et al. 2000 (Spain) | 39.85 |  | Vano et al. 1992 (Spain) |  | 39.90 | Curaj et al. 2005a (Serbia) | 23.3 |  | Curaj et al. 2005b (Serbia) | 15 | 18 | Vardus et al. 2005 (Switzerland) | 67 |  | This study | 16.6 | 20.1 | <p>Table 2: Mean and third quartile DAP values for BaE</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Author</th> <th>mean</th> <th>3<sup>rd</sup> quartile</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>DWP, 1992 (UK)</td> <td></td> <td>60</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Martin &amp; Hunter, 1994 (UK)</td> <td>24.4</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Broadhead et al. 1995</td> <td>13.88 (D)</td> <td>31</td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>25.35 (C)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hart et al. 1996 (UK)</td> <td></td> <td>32.2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hart et al. 2002 (UK)</td> <td></td> <td>31</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Hart et al. 2007 (UK)</td> <td></td> <td>24</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Warren-Forward et al. 1998 (UK)</td> <td>25 (D)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td>28 (C)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Engel-Hills, 1997 (SA)</td> <td></td> <td>84</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Carroll &amp; Brennan, 2003 (Ireland)</td> <td></td> <td>47</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Yakoumakis et al. 1999 (Greece)</td> <td>35.2 (C)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Delichas et al. 2004 (Greece)</td> <td>61 (C)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Ruiz-Cruces et al. 2000 (Spain)</td> <td>56.87</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vano et al. 1992 (Spain)</td> <td>45.19</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Cinj et al. 2005b (Serbia)</td> <td>39</td> <td>41</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Vardus et al. 2005 (Switzerland)</td> <td>102</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Kemerink et al. 2001 (Netherlands)</td> <td>51 (D)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Lampinen &amp; Rannikko, 1999 (Finland)</td> <td>35.8 (C)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>This study</td> <td>28.7</td> <td>36.5</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | Author | mean | 3 <sup>rd</sup> quartile | DWP, 1992 (UK) |  | 60 | Martin & Hunter, 1994 (UK) | 24.4 |  | Broadhead et al. 1995 | 13.88 (D) | 31 |  | 25.35 (C) |  | Hart et al. 1996 (UK) |  | 32.2 | Hart et al. 2002 (UK) |  | 31 | Hart et al. 2007 (UK) |  | 24 | Warren-Forward et al. 1998 (UK) | 25 (D) |  |  | 28 (C) |  | Engel-Hills, 1997 (SA) |  | 84 | Carroll & Brennan, 2003 (Ireland) |  | 47 | Yakoumakis et al. 1999 (Greece) | 35.2 (C) |  | Delichas et al. 2004 (Greece) | 61 (C) |  | Ruiz-Cruces et al. 2000 (Spain) | 56.87 |  | Vano et al. 1992 (Spain) | 45.19 |  | Cinj et al. 2005b (Serbia) | 39 | 41 | Vardus et al. 2005 (Switzerland) | 102 |  | Kemerink et al. 2001 (Netherlands) | 51 (D) |  | Lampinen & Rannikko, 1999 (Finland) | 35.8 (C) |  | This study | 28.7 | 36.5 |
| Author                                                                   | mean                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 3 <sup>rd</sup> quartile                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| DWP, 1992 (UK)                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 25                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Broadhead et al. 1995 (UK)                                               | 7.75 (D)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Hart et al. 1996 (UK)                                                    | 24.18(C)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Warren-Forward et al. 1998 (UK)                                          | 11.39 (D)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | 17.1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Hart et al. 2002 (UK)                                                    | 21.26 (C)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Hart et al. 2007 (UK)                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 13                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Carroll & Brennan, 2003 (Ireland)                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 13                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Yakoumakis et al. 1999 (Greece)                                          | 23.3                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 17                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Delichas et al. 2004 (Greece)                                            | 25                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Geleijns et al. 1998 (Netherlands)                                       | 15 (D)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Ruiz-Cruces et al. 2000 (Spain)                                          | 28 (C)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Ruiz-Cruces et al. 2000 (Spain)                                          | 39.85                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Vano et al. 1992 (Spain)                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 39.90                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Curaj et al. 2005a (Serbia)                                              | 23.3                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Curaj et al. 2005b (Serbia)                                              | 15                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | 18                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Vardus et al. 2005 (Switzerland)                                         | 67                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| This study                                                               | 16.6                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 20.1                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Author                                                                   | mean                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 3 <sup>rd</sup> quartile                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| DWP, 1992 (UK)                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 60                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Martin & Hunter, 1994 (UK)                                               | 24.4                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Broadhead et al. 1995                                                    | 13.88 (D)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | 31                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
|                                                                          | 25.35 (C)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Hart et al. 1996 (UK)                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 32.2                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Hart et al. 2002 (UK)                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 31                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Hart et al. 2007 (UK)                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 24                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Warren-Forward et al. 1998 (UK)                                          | 25 (D)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
|                                                                          | 28 (C)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Engel-Hills, 1997 (SA)                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 84                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Carroll & Brennan, 2003 (Ireland)                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | 47                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Yakoumakis et al. 1999 (Greece)                                          | 35.2 (C)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Delichas et al. 2004 (Greece)                                            | 61 (C)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Ruiz-Cruces et al. 2000 (Spain)                                          | 56.87                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Vano et al. 1992 (Spain)                                                 | 45.19                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Cinj et al. 2005b (Serbia)                                               | 39                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     | 41                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Vardus et al. 2005 (Switzerland)                                         | 102                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Kemerink et al. 2001 (Netherlands)                                       | 51 (D)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| Lampinen & Rannikko, 1999 (Finland)                                      | 35.8 (C)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| This study                                                               | 28.7                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | 36.5                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
| 3. Investigate causes for dose variation                                 | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Absent direct correlation between dose received and patients' weight (R= -0.06), not statistically significant (p= 0.387)</li> <li>• Mean fluoroscopy time (FT): 7.67 minutes. No direct correlation between FT and DAP values (R= 0.42) and not statistically significant (p= 0.06).</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Weak direct correlation between dose received and patients' weight (R= 0.55) that was statistically significant (p= 0.0082)</li> <li>• Mean FT: 5.28 minutes. No direct correlation between FT and DAP values (R= -0.26) and not statistically significant (p= 0.134).</li> </ul> |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |
|                                                                          | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>* Correlation between experience of radiologist and reduction of radiation dose</li> <li>* Lower dose from digital fluoroscopy units as compared to conventional units</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |          |  |                       |          |  |                                 |           |      |                       |           |  |                       |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |      |    |                               |    |  |                                    |        |  |                                 |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |  |       |                             |      |  |                             |    |    |                                  |    |  |            |      |      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |        |      |                          |                |  |    |                            |      |  |                       |           |    |  |           |  |                       |  |      |                       |  |    |                       |  |    |                                 |        |  |  |        |  |                        |  |    |                                   |  |    |                                 |          |  |                               |        |  |                                 |       |  |                          |       |  |                            |    |    |                                  |     |  |                                    |        |  |                                     |          |  |            |      |      |

## Conclusions

1. The median DAP values of 13.6 Gy<sub>cm</sub><sup>2</sup> and 27.4 Gy<sub>cm</sub><sup>2</sup> for BaM and BaE respectively are the recommended DRDLs as they are less affected by under and over weight of the patients.
2. Radiation dose increased with patients' weight for BaE unlike BaM.
3. There was no direct linear correlation between DAP and fluoroscopy time for both BaM and BaE. This was however attributed to comparing radiologists at different levels of training employing different equipment types.
4. Increased experience of the radiologist resulted in lower dose delivery.
5. Radiation dose savings were realised with digital units as compared to conventional fluoroscopy units.

## Acknowledgement

1. The state hospitals where the research was conducted

## References

- Carroll, E.M. & Brennan, P.C. 2003. Radiation doses for barium enema and barium meal examinations in Ireland: potential diagnostic reference levels. *The British Journal Radiology*, 76:393-397.
- Engel-Hills, P.C. & Hering, E.R. 2001. Dose-area product measurements during barium enema radiograph examinations—a Western Cape study. *South African Medical Journal*, 91(8):693-696.
- DWP (Dosimetry Working Party of the Institute of Physical Sciences in Medicine). 1992. *National protocol for patient dose measurement in diagnostic radiology*. Chilton: NRPPB (National Radiation Protection Board).
- Hart, D., Hillier, M.C. & Wall, B.F. 2007. *Doses to patients from radiographic and fluoroscopic x-ray imaging procedures in the UK-2005 review*. Chilton: Health Protection Agency-Radiation Protection Division (HPA-RPD)-029.
- Matthews, K. & Brennan, P.C. 2008. The application of diagnostic reference levels: general principles and an Irish perspective. *Radiography*, xx:1-8.
- For further information, please contact first author:  
Tobie.Kotze@uct.ac.za